

**Healthcare Workforce Development Division**

400 R Street, Suite 330
 Sacramento, California 95811-6213
 (916) 326-3700
 Fax (916) 322-2588
 www.oshpd.ca.gov

**March 6, 2008 Minutes****California Healthcare Workforce Clearinghouse Advisory Team**

Meeting Location: Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development; 400 R Street, Room 317, Sacramento, CA 95811; 10:00 a.m. – 1:00 p.m.

Members Present:

Elizabeth Abbott
 Ignatius Bau
 Cindy Beck
 David Carlisle
 Larry Clark
 Fei Collier
 Linda Davis-Alldritt,
 Andrea Gerstenberger
 Paty Gonzalez
 Paul Gusman
 Murray Haberman
 Jimmy Hara
 Warren Hayes
 Marsha Hirano-Nakanishi
 Jim Koontz
 Moreen Lane
 Stephanie Leach
 Jose Millan
 Linda Nguy
 Sabina Ohri
 Amanda Stangis

Organization:

Health Access California
 The California Endowment
 Health Occupations Students of America
 Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development
 Employment Development Division, Labor Market Information Division
 Department of Health Care Services
 Department of Education
 University of California - Office of the President
 California State Rural Health Association
 Department of Education
 California Postsecondary Education Commission
 California Healthcare Workforce Policy Commission
 Department of Mental Health
 California State University – Office of the Chancellor
 California Association of Health Facilities - Quality Care Health Foundation
 California Workforce Investment Board
 California Labor and Workforce Development Agency
 California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office
 Latino Coalition for a Healthy California
 Public Policy Institute of California
 California Primary Care Association

Members Not Present:

Margaret Beed
 Gail Blanchard-Saiger
 Lucinda Ehnes
 Kathleen Flores
 Chet Hewitt
 Mark Horton
 Carrie Lopez
 Rona Sherriff
 Brian Stiger
 Ellen Wu
 Gary Yates

California Conference of Local Health Officers
 California Hospital Association
 Department of Managed Health Care
 California Health Professions Consortium
 Sierra Health Foundation
 Department of Public Health
 Department of Consumer Affairs
 Senate Office of Research
 California Board of Chiropractic Examiners
 California Pan-Ethnic Health Network
 The California Wellness Foundation

OSHPD Staff: Felicia Borges, Garth Fryer, Donald Gaither, Steve Langridge, Chris Maneely, Angela Minniefield, Senita Robinson, Gloria Robertson, Dorian Rodriguez, Monique Scott, Deb Wong

Handouts: Staff provided each member an agenda, Power Point presentations and a binder of materials for reference at all Advisory Team meetings.

DISCUSSION ITEM: OVERVIEW OF OSHPD

Dr. David Carlisle welcomed everyone to the meeting. He expressed that the mission of OSHPD is to promote healthcare accessibility through leadership in analyzing California's healthcare infrastructure, promoting a diverse and competent healthcare workforce, providing information about healthcare outcomes, assuring the safety of buildings used in providing healthcare, insuring loans to encourage the development of healthcare facilities, and facilitating development of sustained capacity for communities to address local healthcare issues.

OSHPD's role in implementing Senate Bill 139 is to develop a Healthcare Workforce Clearinghouse that collects and expands healthcare workforce and education data throughout California. The Clearinghouse will centralize collected data into one location to allow easy access by everyone. The Advisory Team is instrumental in ensuring that the Clearinghouse achieves a successful implementation process.

DISCUSSION ITEM: OVERVIEW OF SB 139 HEALTHCARE WORKFORCE CLEARINGHOUSE

Angela Minniefield, HWDD Deputy Director, presented information that describes the criteria outlined in the Clearinghouse statute, an anticipated implementation timeline, and potential benefits to data users.

- The Clearinghouse will collect, to the extent available, data by specialty on supply; geographical distribution; diversity; demand; and educational capacity to produce trained, certified and licensed health care workers.
- The Clearinghouse will provide one central place at the state level to locate healthcare workforce/educational data.
- Statutory partners include the Employment Development Department's Labor Market Information Division, 18 state health licensing boards, and 3 higher education state level entities, including the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, California State University Chancellor's Office and the University of California Chancellor's Office.
- OSHPD must prepare an annual report to the Legislature that identifies education and employment trends, supply and demand for healthcare workers, gaps in the educational pipeline, and policy recommendations that address workforce shortage and distribution issues.
- Clearinghouse benefits also include improving health professions awareness, recruitment, and retention activities statewide.

DISCUSSION ITEM: ADVISORY TEAM, ROLES, AND RESPONSIBILITIES

Angela Minniefield stated the purpose of the Advisory Team is to help provide guidance, coordination, and support for the Clearinghouse. The Advisory Team will share expertise and help identify strategies that improve collection and dissemination of existing health data, promote communication, minimize state level duplication, and bridge healthcare workforce activities, where feasible.

Senita Robinson, Manager, HWDD Health Careers Training Program, reviewed the Advisory Team's proposed membership, roles and 2008 work plan. Membership includes representation from state/local government, workforce development, education, and healthcare employers, membership

organizations, policy advocates, student organizations, funding organizations, consumer representatives, etc.

The Advisory Team suggested that OSHPD research other states to determine if they have created similar Clearinghouses. Ms. Robinson stated OSHPD is completing a matrix comparison outlining other states' health data centralization efforts. To date, OSHPD has contacted the states of Michigan, North Carolina, Texas, South Dakota and Tennessee.

Action: Staff will provide information on other states at the next Advisory Team meeting on May 22, 2008.

DISCUSSION ITEM: HEALTH PROFESSIONS SHORTAGES

Angela Minniefield presented a brief overview of the HWDD and information on California's health professional shortages. The HWDD assists in workforce development, distribution of services, and identifies unmet healthcare professional needs in geographic shortage areas. She discussed what affect the shortages have on the delivery of health services.

Through a Cooperative Agreement, OSHPD works with the U.S. Health Resources and Services Administration to identify California health professional shortage areas (HPSA). A HPSA affords designated areas the ability to obtain recruitment, retention and funding opportunities. There are 51 counties with at least one federally designated HPSA. To determine a HPSA, the number of people within the county boundaries, population, ratio or provide-to-population, supply and demand, and census numbers need to be assessed in the community to determine the number of primary care physicians, dentists, or mental health professionals that need to be provided for that area. Ms. Minniefield reiterated that the Clearinghouse would become a centralized platform for health workforce data and information to address the health workforce shortages.

Factors that impact health workforce shortages include the following:

- Aging population (minimal replacements for those who are retiring);
- Health educational programs are costly;
- Universities and colleges lack faculty to teach healthcare courses;
- Increasing reliance on hiring nurses/physicians from other states or countries to fill available slots;
- Inability to maintain health professionals demand by population growth;
- Rising challenges to find cures for new diseases; and
- Overall profile of nurses, physicians, dental hygienists, dentists, and physician assistants by race, ethnicity, and languages reveals a mismatch between population and provider demographics.

Staff provided a listing of the various health occupations targeted for Clearinghouse data collection. The occupations are listed according to their titles in the Standard Occupational Classification (SOC) System and the Classification Instructional Programs (CIP). The Advisory Team suggested that OSHPD consider regional best practices to collect data and use the cross walk between the CIP and SOC coding structures to identify health occupations.

Ms. Minniefield stated the Clearinghouse data collection and analysis would validate existing programs or identify new programs for implementation. For example, if a registered nurse is granted a scholarship in a HPSA, but OSHPD has data on an area with a nursing surplus, a priority for the funding could go to someone else. The Advisory Team's assistance is needed to identify statewide and regional areas of need for healthcare professionals. Ms. Robinson stated that outreach programs are necessary and requested the Advisory Team to think outside the box to bring awareness to the public concerning health workforce activities within communities.

Action: Advisory Team reviews the listing of health occupations (Tab 5) and the Job Opening Projections listing (Tab 7) to determine if certain occupations are missing from health occupations.

DISCUSSION ITEM: HEALTHCARE WORKFORCE CLEARINGHOUSE NEEDS ASSESSMENT

Chris Maneely, Pacific Project Management Inc. (PPM) presented an overview of OSHPD's effort to begin development of the Clearinghouse data infrastructure. Since 1999, Mr. Maneely has managed several data systems for OSHPD that receive statewide patient and critical healthcare information for dissemination to the public. PPM discussed anticipated activities to gather and collect available data, potential barriers and challenges in data collection.

Mr. Maneely stated the data collection effort would be challenging. However, it is a great opportunity to bring together stakeholders to address health professions data issues and build a statewide system for all data providers and users simultaneously.

During the discussion, participants outlined critical areas for the Advisory Team to consider while undertaking their activities in supporting the Clearinghouse.

- It is critical that organizations break out of their silos to provide data to the Clearinghouse. The Clearinghouse will be successful if all stakeholders work together for the common good to meet consumer needs and heighten public awareness.
- Clearinghouse information must be easily accessible to the public. OSHPD should obtain feedback from constituents to meet state, local, and regional needs.
- Not all data is data and will not be available. OSHPD recognizes that the statutory partners collect some of the required data. OSHPD could therefore work with the statutory partners to develop survey instruments that induce the missing data. The Advisory Team must recognize the importance of "how" the data is collected to determine its usability.
- OSHPD does not want to duplicate efforts, and looks to Advisory Team and other stakeholders who have supplied reports with current analysis on healthcare specialties pertaining to race, ethnicity, and geographical distribution shortage areas.

Action: OSHPD staff will complete the Clearinghouse data matrix (Tab 11) and provide at the next Advisory Team meeting on May 22, 2008.

DISCUSSION ITEM: REGIONAL FOCUS GROUP MEETINGS

Senita Robinson discussed OSHPD's plan to convene regional focus groups to collect information from potential Clearinghouse stakeholder users. The focus groups participants will help staff identify data needs and expectations to meet Senate Bill 139 data requirements from the standpoint of the end user. The overall needs assessment will provide a framework to help address regional business

needs and technical solutions; thereby, enable the Clearinghouse information systems technical team to design a comprehensive, effective user-friendly data warehouse infrastructure.

Five focus groups are scheduled as follows: Fresno, Oakland, Ontario/Inland Empire, Redding and Los Angeles. Staff provided a listing of potential participants and requested the Advisory Team assist in identifying additional participants and coordination activities. Ms. Robinson stated the Advisory Team members are invited to attend at least one of the focus group sessions.

Focus group participants include the following stakeholders: educators, hospitals, clinics, advocacy groups, state/local government, health professionals associations, individual consumers, industry associations and many others.

Action: Staff will email the Advisory Team the focus group meeting dates and locations. The Advisory Team will recommend participant names and assist with notification activities. Staff will prepare focus group findings for discussion at the next Advisory Team meeting on May 22, 2008.

CLOSING COMMENTS AND ADJOURNMENT

Angela Minniefield commented that OSHPD will be using existing data and relying on other collected information for the Clearinghouse, to the extent data is available. She invited and encouraged feedback on improving OSHPD services to the public and how the Clearinghouse can assist consumers.